77 00853

Report on the Conduct of a

PERFORMANCE AUDIT of the DEPARTMENT of PUBLIC SAFETY

CITY of SUNNYVALE

[Sunnyvale. City manager]
[Sunnyvale. Dept. of public safety]
Police admin. Sunnyvale
Fire prev. Admin. "
Admin. Methods "
Munic admin "
Labor prod. Civil emp'ly

Prepared for

CITY of SUNNYVALE, CALIFORNIA

February 1976

INSTITUTE OF GOVERNMENTAL STUDIES LIBRARY
FEB. 7 1977
UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA

Prepared by

PMM&Co PEAT, MARWICK, MITCHELL & CO.

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2025 with funding from
State of California and California State Library

https://archive.org/details/C123318062

PEAT, MARWICK, MITCHELL & CO.
1025 CONNECTICUT AVE., N. W.
WASHINGTON, D. C. 20036

February 6, 1976

Mr. John E. Dever, City Manager
City of Sunnyvale
456 West Olive Avenue
Sunnyvale, California 94086

Dear Mr. Dever:

We have completed the second phase of the project to determine the feasibility of utilizing the General Accounting Office's Standards for Audit of Governmental Organizations, Programs, Activities and Functions as a basis for performance auditing of local government functions. The first phase entailed the formulation of the performance audit approach and the preparation of a program for the performance audit of a municipal function. This, the second phase, entailed the conduct of the performance audit in that municipal function.

Attached to this letter are two documents. The first is the second phase project report. It contains four chapters. The first chapter provides the background of the project. The second describes the performance auditing process as conducted during this phase and discusses some special considerations and conclusions developed during the process. The third describes the performance report developed during the performance audit process. (A copy of that report is also attached to this letter.) The fourth chapter provides our overall conclusions.

In our opinion, performance auditing based upon Standards for Audit of Governmental Organizations, Programs, Activities and Functions is a highly beneficial management tool for local government. It provides a vehicle for both improving operations and reporting results. Significant preparation must be undertaken for a proper performance audit; e.g., definition of programs and goals, documentation of pertinent data systems, and preparation of a comprehensive audit program. These in themselves, however, help to improve the governmental functions. Further, if these elements exist, performance auditing is highly replicable and can be accomplished mainly by individuals possessing existing auditing skills.

* * * * *

7700853

INSTITUTE OF GOVERNMENTAL STUDIES LIBRARY
109 PHILOSOPHY HALL
UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA
BERKELEY, CA 94720

We would again like to acknowledge the enthusiastic participation of the City of Sunnyvale and its personnel in this important project and hope that it will lead to continuing improvement of municipal management.

Very truly yours,

Peat, Marwick, Mitchell & Co.

REPORT ON THE CONDUCT OF A PERFORMANCE AUDIT OF THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SAFETY CITY OF SUNNYVALE

Table of Contents

Section		Page
I.	BACKGROUND	I. 1
II.	CONDUCT OF THE PERFORMANCE AUDIT	II. 1
	The Performance Audit Process	II. 1
	Other Considerations and Conclusions	II. 4
III.	THE PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT	III. 1
	Recommended Format	III. 1
	The Accountant's Responsibility	III. 2
	Accountant's Opinion	III. 3
	Disposition of Performance Report	III. 4
IV.	OVERALL CONCLUSIONS	IV. 1
	The City's Reactions	IV. 1
	Our Conclusions	IV. 1

Attachment

Performance Audit Report for the City of Sunnyvale, Department of Public Safety for the Year Ended June 30, 1975

I. BACKGROUND

In June 1972, the U. S. General Accounting Office (GAO) published Standards for Audit of Governmental Organizations, Programs, Activities and Functions (SAGOPAF). The purpose of this publication was to set forth a body of standards that could be used in auditing all governmental entities and funds. SAGOPAF stated that audits of governmental units should consider more than just an examination of financial information. They should also encompass an evaluation of compliance with pertinent laws and regulations, the efficient and economical use of resources, and the accomplishment of desired end results. Because this suggested a unique and potentially powerful way in which auditing skills could be applied, the City of Sunnyvale, in cooperation with the International City Management Association (ICMA), the General Accounting Office, and Peat, Marwick, Mitchell & Co. (PMM&Co.) its independent auditors, participated in a pilot project to determine if and how the Standards could be used as a basis for auditing the performance of municipal functions.

The first phase of this pilot project was completed in mid-1974. In the first phase, a conceptual approach to performance auditing utilizing the SAGOPAF concept was formulated and an audit program for a performance audit of the City's Department of Public Safety was developed. Also, a tentative conclusion was reached that performance auditing based upon the GAO Standards was possible. A report entitled Study and Development of a Performance Audit Program for the Department of Public Safety, City of Sunnyvale, dated August 1974, was prepared. (The report describes the first phase of the project in detail and should be read in conjunction with this, the second phase report.)

Performance auditing should be, above all, a management tool. It was decided, therefore, that the City's Department of Public Safety should operate for at least a year on the basis of evaluative criteria and goals established during the first phase of the project, that there should be continuous management reviews during that year, and that the conduct of the first performance audit should not take place until after the end of the year.

Peat, Marwick, Mitchell & Co. conducted the performance audit of the Department of Public Safety, both as an audit of the Department and as the second phase in the project to determine the feasibility of using SAGOPAF for performance auditing at the local level. The remainder of this report describes the second phase. More specifically,

it discusses the performance audit process and describes the performance report developed by the project. It also presents our overall conclusions regarding the use of performance auditing as a management process in local government. Appended to this project report is a copy of the performance audit report for the City of Sunnyvale, Department of Public Safety for the Year Ended June 30, 1975.

II. CONDUCT OF THE PERFORMANCE AUDIT

The performance audit was based, for the most part, on the audit program developed as part of the project's first phase. (A copy of the program is contained in Study and Development of a Performance Audit Program for the Department of Public Safety, City of Sunnyvale.) It is appropriate, however, to briefly describe the performance audit process. The parallel between the process, at least as undertaken in this project, and the traditional financial auditing process is great enough to suggest that the initial belief that only persons with skills in the audited function can act as performance auditors is not necessarily so when a thorough preaudit survey has been made and a complete and comprehensvie audit program has been developed. In other words, with proper preparation, a performance audit can be undertaken by certified pubic accountants, other financial auditors, and other individuals possessing analytical skills.

The other conclusions we reached, as well as the instances where the performance audit process was undertaken differently than planned, are discussed in the second section of this chapter.

THE PERFORMANCE AUDIT PROCESS

The performance audit process began with a meeting with the Chief of the Department and his program managers. The purpose of the meeting was to explain the objectives for the performance audit and the general approach that would be used. The meeting was also used to answer questions Department personnel had about the audit.

Verification of Data

The audit itself was divided into two segments: (1) the verification of data, and (2) the evaluation of program results, economy, efficiency, and compliance. In order to verify data, we utilized the same kinds of procedures that are utilized in a financial audit. In other words, we traced transactions through the system to ascertain if the Department was still using the procedures that had been identified and flow charted during the preparation of the audit program, undertook compliance testing of the various internal control features, obtained the performance reports prepared by Department personnel, and conducted substantive testing to determine the reliability of the data in these reports.

Also, we asked questions as to whether various processes were taking place and attempted to observe what actually was happening.

The verification of data was facilitated by the utilization of two advanced auditing techniques: statistical sampling and computer auditing. Statistical sampling was used to enable us to draw conclusions about the large numbers of events, conditions, transactions, etc. that occurred during the year without having to examine more than a relatively few. We did this by:

- Identifying the events, conditions, etc. for which statistical sampling could be used, e.g., building plans reviewed.

- Defining the size of the population, the characteristic we wished to verify, and the sampling unit, e.g., the population is 500, the characteristic is the review of the plan, and the sampling unit is a building permit.

- Determining the confidence and precision limits, and the required sample size, e.g., 95%, 5%, and 59.

- Defining the test to be made, e.g., examine hard copy files for an inspection report.

- Selecting an attribute sample from among the population.

- Conducting the test and ascertaining the number of instances of error, e.g., no or incomplete inspection.

- Drawing conclusions.

Naturally, a person experienced in statistical auditing techniques had to direct this effort.

For computer auditing, we utilized PMM&Co.'s System/2170 program to test computations and summarizations, compare files, and to retrieve information for analytical review or subsequent testing. This approach, which required computer auditing skills, was accomplished by:

- Obtaining an understanding of how the City's data is processed by computer.

- Defining the audit objectives for the audit areas in which we were utilizing computer auditing.

- Formulating and documenting computer audit procedures.

- Defining the applicable computer file formats.

- Selecting the appropriate computer audit operating steps and output.

- Running the computer audit program.

- Reviewing the results.

Evaluation of Results

The evaluation of program results, efficiency and economy, and compliance was accomplished by comparing actual results with intended results, reviewing the narrative portions of the Department's performance reports, interviewing responsible personnel at various levels within the Department utilizing the general review questions in the audit program as a guide, and reviewing other pertinent reports and records. Observations and tentative conclusions were discussed with program managers and the Department's senior managers during the course of the audit. The comments made by these individuals in the reports and orally were evaluated by us. Those that were not entirely without merit became the basis for that portion of the performance audit report that sets forth the client's reactions.

At the same time, we finalized our conclusions and formulated our own recommendations regarding performance, i.e., the accomplishment or lack of accomplishment of the intended end results, the manner in which resources were being used, and the ways in which the Department attempted to comply with the applicable laws and regulations. These were also discussed with the program and senior managers.

Preparation of Report

Our next steps were to develop a draft for this initial performance audit report, forward it to the City for review, and meet with the City Manager and members of his staff to discuss the report. The most significant outcome of this meeting was a feeling that there should

be more candidness in the Department's comments section of the report. The City Manager, therefore, suggested that he should review the Department's comments with the Department of Public Safety personnel and determine if and how they should be modified. This additional task was undertaken, and the report was then finalized. As stated, the final performance audit report is appended to this project report.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS

As indicated, this was the first performance audit of a municipal function based upon the General Accounting Office's Standards for Audit of Governmental Organizations, Programs, Activities and Functions. While we and the City undertook considerable planning and communication, there were many instances where one or the other undertook unplanned steps in order to facilitate the process, where a misunderstanding inhibited the execution of the planned process, where insight gained from the audit itself showed that perhaps the approach should be changed, etc. This section attempts to summarize these instances.

Preparing for the Audit

One of the purposes of the preaudit survey in the first phase of this project was to identify the criteria upon which the performance audit would be conducted. No thought was given at that time, however, to what reports would be audited. Fortunately, at the beginning of the fiscal year, the Department instituted a procedure whereby each program manager was responsible for reviewing data, evaluating his operation in relation to that data, and preparing a written report. These reports, therefore, furnished the starting point for the verification of data tasks as well as the initial input to reasons for unexpected performance.

This unplanned approach had a threefold benefit. First, it demonstrated that the performance data was used as part of a management process and was not being collected only for audit purposes. Second, since the managers used the data to manage their operations, they felt well prepared for the audit. Third, they expressed a feeling that no special preparation was needed for the performance audit. Thus, they were fully cooperative during the audit itself.

The Data Problem

Perhaps the biggest problem in this initial performance audit was the unavailability of data to audit. The audit program was explicit in the data that would be examined, but the Departmental personnel evidently did not consider data in terms of a subsequent examination. Hence, in some instances data was collected, used for production of the quarterly reports, and then discarded. In other instances, data was not auditable because estimates had been used or because none had been collected at all. In the latter case, the Department felt that a particular criteria was a good incentive for operating personnel and should be included in a performance report, but that collection of the data would not be cost-effective. In still other instances, summary information was prepared and the underlying detail was discarded. Finally, some information was deemed sensitive and a decision was made not to share it with the auditors.

We believe these problems can be overcome if several steps are taken. First, once the audit program is completed, instructions defining what data is to be collected and retained should be written to the audited unit. Accounting departments have been subject to financial audits for many years and are in the habit of retaining data. Auditing, however, is a new experience for operating department personnel and it is inappropriate to assume that they would have the same retention practices. Second, the auditor should identify the particular personnel who are responsible for collecting and summarizing performance information and preparing analyses. A relationship should then be established with these individuals in order to save time, minimize misunderstandings and communications failures, and provide a source for authoritative replies to inquiries. Third, if using statistical sampling or computer auditing, it would be appropriate to develop the sampling plans and to test computer audit programs well in advance of the audit. This would assure that the needed data would be available, plus enable any programming or data processing problems to be identified and corrected before the audit begins.

Evaluative Criteria and Goals

In many programs, actual performance greatly exceeded the intended performance; in others, performance fell far short of intended results. These wide variances were obviously not due entirely to erratic performance. Many were due primarily to the difficulty of establishing reasonable goals in the absence of extensive records of past performance.

It must be recognized, therefore, that goal-setting in the first few years must be an iterative process requiring the continuous monitoring of performance and permitting the updating of goals as deemed appropriate. Some goals will be changed to more realistic values, some to reflect the choice of a better criteria for evaluating a program, and some to reflect changes in priorities. Indeed, approximately 50 percent of our recommendations in the performance audit of the Department of Public Safety are for refining or modifiying criteria and goals.

On the other hand, goal-setting should not be too informal or it loses its effectiveness as a management tool. A department's top management must concur in any revisions, deletions, or substitutions of goals. The reasons for changes should be documented both for management review and as a historical record of the evolution of the current criteria and goals.

Also, the goals established at the beginning of a year should be included unchanged in the performance report for that year. The Department's remarks concerning performance in relation to the goals can be used to explain if and why a change is appropriate and contemplated. Indeed, the issue of comparability from one year to another must be considered. If too many criteria are changed each year, it may be difficult or impossible to compare performance from one year to another.

Finally, the performance auditing process revealed that with many criteria, data was not available. This is particularly true with criteria involving comparisons of current year's performance with that of the prior year, e.g., reduction of a traffic accident rate. These criteria should not be dropped. Rather, a "non-auditable" symbol should be placed in the audit report and the comments should explain why and what steps are to be taken to obtain the data. With this approach, there will be a full understanding of the complete range of criteria by which performance can be determined.

Staffing the Performance Audit

As indicated, a significant portion of the audit was accomplished by personnel whose primary background is with financial auditing. In our opinion, an even greater portion of the work could have been assigned to those individuals. It should be pointed out, however, that while we have stated that programmatic experience is not critical if a good audit program is available, because this was the first performance audit based on SAGOPAF, we did utilize a person who has had

a direct working experience with police operations to evaluate the program results. The result was that he was able to relate better to the program managers, understand the technical considerations and issues, and provide a better assessment of performance.

We were also able to make extensive, beneficial use of Department of Public Safety cadets during the performance audit. Specifically, the cadets undertook some of the detailed statistical verifications under our direction, after we defined the tasks and made the sample selections. This approach can save time and money and serve as a training medium for such personnel. Thus, in future performance audits, the audit program should be reviewed in advance and a determination made of the tasks that can be done by personnel such as cadets. An estimate of the time requirements should be made and the necessary staff committed to the audit.

Finally, we found that within limits, it was highly beneficial to use the same staff on the audit that previously surveyed the Department's operations and prepared the performance audit program. They were familiar with the Department's procedures and personnel, had an understanding of the Department's management techniques, and did not require "start-up" time. Naturally, some familiarization can be obtained reviewing the audit program, survey working papers, and Departmental publications, but the best sense of understanding is obtained by previous direct contact with the audited entity.

Possibility of Interim Auditing

Since this was the first performance audit and the Department had to have a full year to work with the criteria and accumulate data, the audit was not begun until after the end of the year. Once performance auditing becomes an ongoing process, however, it should be possible to develop an approach which provides for interim work during the year.

Specifically, with a relatively small amount of time, say a day or two each quarter, an auditor could make selected tests of data being collected for the period to both verify its accuracy and to test the workings of the information system. If any problems existed, they could be identified and corrected in a timely fashion.

Some additional testing of data would be necessary at the end of the fiscal year. It would be extremely limited, however, and the audit effort could concentrate instead on the evaluation of why performance was not as intended.

III. THE PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

The first phase encompassed the formulation of a conceptual approach to performance auditing based upon SAGOPAF, and the development of a performance audit program. It did not consider the format of a performance audit report other than that there had to be some type of report at the end of a performance audit, and that it had to fulfill several reporting standards contained in SAGOPAF. More precisely, we know that a performance audit report would have to:

- Explain the scope and objectives of the audit.
- Include recognition of noteworthy accomplishments.
- Include recognition of the views of responsible officials in the organization.
- Include the auditor's recommendations for actions.
- Be as concise, clear, and complete as possible.
- Present factual matter accurately.

A major portion of the second phase, therefore, was devoted to determining a recommended format for a performance audit report based upon SAGOPAF, and considering the implications of that recommendation.

RECOMMENDED FORMAT

The recommended format for a performance report that fulfills the Comptroller General's Standards for Audit of Governmental Organizations, Programs, Activities and Functions is as presented in the attachment to this report. That format is divided into three elements.

The first element is the report of performance. This is accomplished by listing (1) criteria (organized by program) that the City has already chosen for defining performance, and that we have reviewed for validity and relevance; (2) the intended performance as expressed in terms of each of the criteria, i.e., the goals; and (3) the actual performance expressed numercially. Similar information is presented

for the production plan, which is a unique type of output data used in Sunnyvale in the formulation of the budget and the subsequent management of resources.

This reporting and auditing approach is quite similar to what is done in financial reporting and auditing. The report, comprised of data, is developed by City personnel (with information drawn from the quarterly evaluations). The auditors then examine the underlying records to determine the reliability and reasonableness of the report.

The second element in the report is the responsible officials' remakrs concerning performance. It contains the Department's reasons for undesired or unexpected performance, and the plans for changing or eliminating goals and altering operations. This section was also developed mainly from the quarterly evaluations.

The third element in the report contains the auditor's observations and recommendations for improvement. It was developed following our evaluation of actual and intended results and posing of the general review questions contained in the audit program. Naturally, the observations and recommendations were discussed with the management of the Department and the City prior to publication.

Interestingly, in this initial performance audit report the auditor's observations and recommendations section is comprised mainly of recommendations for modifications of criteria and goals, and improvements in the data systems. There are relatively few observations on how operations can be improved. This is another ramification of the first year of measuring actual performance and comparing it to desirable performance. The auditor must first help the auditee develop realistic expectations for desired performance. When that is accomplished, he can devote more attention to ways to improve operations.

THE ACCOUNTANT'S RESPONSIBILITY

The GAO Standards state that, "auditing is an important part of the accountability process since it provides independent jugments of the credibility of public officials' statements...." (page 4). It is clear that with this statement, the GAO is suggesting an independent review of performance reports. This raises questions, however, as to the extent to which an independent auditor can establish credibility for the audited unit.

The first portion of a performance report is data. While data is normally subject to verification, quite frequently there are missing elements in the information systems and the information is thus not completely verifiable. Even Sunnyvale, with its excellent and widely acclaimed information system, was no exception. As stated in the prior chapter, much of its data was not verifiable.

Thus, we feel that at present it is inappropriate to expect an auditor to assume the same level of responsibility for the credibility of a performance report as he does for a financial report. Further, when an auditor does not accept responsibility explicitly, but permits his name to be associated with a report, this imposes a responsibility on him since the reader still assumes that the data can be relied upon. Accordingly, if in any way the auditor feels that the performance results are inaccurate, unreliable, or misleading, we believe he would be acting properly in advising that his name not be associated with the report.

The second portion of the performance report, i.e., the Department's remarks, contains subjective conclusions and reactions and statements about planned future actions. Thus, even if the performance audit report contained a statement from the auditor regarding the reliability of the Department's data, the statement could not cover the remarks. Subjective statements and statements about the future are not the kinds of things an independent auditor can evaluate for credibility. Furthermore, if the auditor disagrees with the client's interpretation of results and/or the practicability of plans for the future, he can furnish his own conclusions in the third section of the performance report, i.e., the accountant's comments.

ACCOUNTANT'S OPINION

The consideration of the independent auditor's responsibility led to an extensive discussion of whether an accountant's opinion should be provided on any reports containing performance, efficiency and economy, or compliance results, similar to what is provided for audited financial reports. In other words, how does the auditor state or disclaim his responsibility in respect of the audited data? Included in SAGOPAF is a standard that the report must clearly explain the scope and objectives of the audit. In a financial audit, the accountant's report is where both of these are stated.

After considerable deliberation, it was decided that an accountant's report, patterned after the accountant's report in a financial audit,

would not be appropriate at this time. First, neither the SAGOPAF nor the AICPA's publication, Auditing Standards Established by the GAO: Their Meaning and Significance for CPAs, contemplate an accountant's opinion. Second, providing an accountant's report similar to the one used following a financial audit suggests a degree of exactitude that does not presently exist. Third, the uncertainty of the information in most performance audits, at least at first, would require a disclaimer on the reasonableness of the presentation. This negativism is not appropriate for performance auditing at this time.

On the other hand, it might be wise to consider the value of an independent accountant's opinion on the fairness of the data at such time as the information systems are, on the whole, more reliable. This would support the fourth basis premise in SAGOPAF, namely that auditing can provide an independent judgment of the credibility of public officials' statements. Second, an independent auditor's opinion accompanying a report enables the reader to feel that the information is a fair presentation, and not simply the unverified creation of the governmental unit. Third, as indicated, when the auditor's name appears with the performance report, he is automatically associated with the reliability of the data. An opinion enables him to state his responsibility clearly and unequivocably.

The approach we have therefore settled upon is a brief transmittal letter that defines the objectives and scope of the audit and the contents of the report resulting from that audit. The transmittal letter and the performance report form the total performance audit report. This is the approach followed in the appended performance audit report.

DISPOSITION OF PERFORMANCE REPORT

We also considered the disposition of the performance audit report. SAGOPAF states that governments should provide their citizens with information on the services provided and the manner in which they are provided. The performance audit report is the vehicle for providing that information.

The City has indicated that it plans to release this performance audit report to the public. Of course, however, performance auditing is a new process. Citizens should not be examining the report out of the context in which it was prepared. Therefore, the City will probably release the performance report as part of the total project report. We concur with this approach.

IV. OVERALL CONCLUSIONS

We have concluded that performance auditing, based on the Comptroller General's Standards for Audit of Governmental Organizations, Programs, Activities and Functions, can be a valuable management tool for local governments. This conclusion is a result of our evaluation of the individual performance auditing processes and how they were applied in this project, and formal and informal discussions regarding performance auditing and the project with management of both the Department and the City.

THE CITY'S REACTIONS

For instance, the Department of Public Safety used the criteria, goals, and performance data throughout the year in managing the Department's programs. (The quarterly review procedure is an example of how the performance data was used.) Ways to improve the operations were easy to discern because performance was being compared against a pre-defined standard. In fact, the Department's managers developed as many, if not more, suggestions for increasing efficiency and effectiveness in the quarterly evaluations as the independent auditor was able to do in the year-end audit. Finally, as Departmental personnel became familiar with the performance audit approach and worked with others in the process, they began to recognize increasing amounts of potential for the process. Within the Department today, there is enthusiasm for performance auditing at the Public Safety Officer level.

Second, while this project was in the Department of Public Safety, other Sunnyvale Department managers were kept informed of the approach and of progress. This had a very positive effect on the remaining City Departments. The usefulness of goals and evaluative criteria was demonstrated, and managers were made aware of the need for valid data. For example, it was felt that program managers would not be as inclined to take an offhanded approach to the goal-setting process in future budgets.

OUR CONCLUSIONS

There are, of course, a few points that should be stressed. Local governments need to continue the process of defining the programs they

provide and the goals for these programs if they are to be able to report performance in terms of results. They must also improve their mechanisms for obtaining pertinent performance data. This should not represent an undue hardship as data are so useful in day-to-day management.

In a more positive vein, much of the audit work associated with a performance audit can be done by existing audit personnel, although there is a need for technical input of various kinds at key points in the process. Top level management support, a complete indoctrination of program managers, and involvement of personnel at all levels are probably the key ingredients for the success of the process. Finally, the disposition of the performance audit report is still a sensitive issue and needs to be fully resolved. Improper use of a performance report can adversely affect goal-setting and probably harm the total process. The citizenry also needs to understand the total process and be made to realize that performance auditing is a management tool.

* * * * *

We repeat. If all of the above can be favorably resolved, performance auditing can become a valuable management tool for local governments.

City of Sunnyvale
Department of Public Safety

Performance Report

Year Ended June 30, 1975

PEAT, MARWICK, MITCHELL & CO.
1025 CONNECTICUT AVE., N. W.
WASHINGTON, D. C. 20036

November 5, 1975

Mr. John E. Dever, City Manager
City of Sunnyvale
456 West Olive Avenue
Sunnyvale, California 94086

Dear Mr. Dever:

We have completed the performance audit of the City of Sunnyvale, Department of Public Safety for the year ended June 30, 1975. The objectives of the performance audit were to review and report upon a report of the intended and actual results of the Department of Public Safety's programs, compliance with applicable laws and regulations, and the efficient and economical use of resources by the Department in the conduct of its regular activities. The audit did not include an examination of financial statements prepared by the Department and the expression of an opinion, as we had heretofore examined the financial statements for the City of Sunnyvale for the year ended June 30, 1975.

The audit was made in accordance with the General Accounting Office's Standards for Audit of Governmental Organizations, Programs, Activities and Functions. Accordingly, the review of intended and actual results considered the validity and relevance of the criteria with which program results are described, an examination and testing of the system for collecting the data that define program results, and a review of conditions affecting the achievement of results. The examination of compliance with applicable laws and regulations included a determination of the laws and regulations applicable to the public safety programs, an extraction of the pertinent provisions of these laws and regulations, examination and testing of the systems for collecting the data that indicate compliance or non-compliance, and a review of conditions affecting compliance. The review of the efficient and economical use of resources included observations of the Department's operations, inquiries with the Department's personnel, and to the extent possible, tests of available documentation which we considered appropriate in the circumstances.

The results of the performance audit of the Department of Public Safety for the year ended June 30, 1975 are presented in the attached Performance Audit Report. The report is composed of two parts. The first part has been prepared by the Department and contains the intended and actual results for each of the Department's programs, expressed in terms of the previously selected evaluation criteria. It also contains the Department's comments concerning intended and actual performance. The second part has been prepared by us and contains our comments for refining the measurement criteria and goals, modifying the data systems, and improving the operations of these programs.

* * * * *

We have enjoyed the opportunity to participate with the City in the preparation of this report. We hope that the material contained within the report will contribute to the City's attempts to continually report results and improve operations.

Very truly yours,

Peat, Marwick, Mitchell & Co.

City of Sunnyvale
Department of Public Safety
Performance Report
Year Ended June 30, 1975

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Performance Reports

Patrol Services Program	Exhibit A
Investigations Program	Exhibit B
Fire Prevention Program	Exhibit C
Fire Suppression Program	Exhibit D
Public Safety Management Program	Exhibit E
Training Program	Exhibit F
Communications Program	Exhibit G
Staff Services Program	Exhibit H

Accountant's Comments

	Page
Overall Management Concerns	1
Patrol Services Program	5
Investigations Program	7
Fire Prevention Program	9
Fire Suppression Program	11
Public Safety Management Program	12
Communications Program	14
Staff Services Program	16

CITY OF SUNNYVALE

DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SAFETY

PATROL SERVICES PROGRAM

Performance Report
Year Ended June 30, 1975

Evaluative Criteria	Intended Program Results: Goals	Accomplishments: No. of Traffic Accidents Yr 73-74	Accomplishments: No. of Traffic Accidents Yr 74-75	Accomplishments: Percent Change	Department of Public Safety Remarks
Traffic Accident Rate	Reduce the accident rate by 10%	1,860	2,135	+15	The established goal was unrealistic. It failed to take into account that no additional resources, over prior years, were budgeted for selective enforcement. In addition, traffic actions were 33 percent lower than projected.

Evaluative Criteria	Intended Program Results: Goals	Accomplishments: No. of Violations Yr 73-74	Accomplishments: No. of Violations Yr 74-75	Accomplishments: Percent Change	Department of Public Safety Remarks
Crime Rate	Reduce violations of law for each type of index crime by 10%				The goal established was unrealistic. Index crimes have increased substantially every year at the local, regional, state, and national levels. As a part of a metropolitan area, it was unrealistic to think a 10 percent reduction would be effected in one year utilizing essentially the same resources as were available in prior years. Although five of the index crimes show increases over Fiscal Year 1974, their incidence is still relatively low, and, except for rape, Sunnyvale has remained within the top 25 percent of cities with populations between 100,000 and 250,000, having the lowest crime rates.
	- Homicide	1	3	+200	
	- Forcible Rape	23	24	+ 4.3	
	- Robbery	71	99	+ 39.4	
	- Aggravated assault	87	74	- 14.9	
	- Burglary	1,380	1,272	- 7.8	
	- Larceny over $50	719	941	+ 30.9	
	- Auto theft	393	402	+ 2.3	

PATROL SERVICES PROGRAM

Intended Program Results

Department of Public Safety Remarks

Response Time

Respond to emergency requests for service within 3 minutes 95% of the time

Resp Time (min.)	No. of Code 3 Response	% of Code 3	Cumulative Percentage
0	25	7.4	7.4
1	35	10.3	17.7
2	73	21.5	39.2
3	81	23.9	63.1
4	55	16.2	79.3
5	34	10.1	89.4
6	13	3.8	93.2
7	11	3.3	96.5
8 and over	12	3.5	100.0
	339	100.0	

Average response time = 3.9 min.
Standard deviation = 3.60

The distribution was obtained from a sample of 13,760 calls, of which 339 were Code 3 responses of the Patrol Division.

PRODUCTION PLAN

	Budgeted	Actual	
Respond to burglary	2,730	1,800	This decline is primarily due to an improved screening of calls, which resulted in a reclassification of many calls to crimes against property.
Respond to sex crimes	264	160	———
Respond to crimes against persons	713	624	———
Respond to crimes against property	6,205	7,347	See remarks under burglary.

PATROL SERVICES PROGRAM

PRODUCTION PLAN	Budgeted	Actual	Department of Public Safety Remarks
Respond to miscellaneous criminal offenses	2,930	1,902	———
Arrests	3,650	4,181	———
Respond to fires and related incidents	687	1,253	———
Investigate incidents involving juveniles	1,128	733	The projection was overstated. In addition, the juvenile population in the city is declining.
Miscellaneous responses	8,105	10,602	———
Respond to disturbances	8,689	9,441	———
Respond to accidents	4,395	3,909	———
Abandoned vehicles activity	3,628	1,749	The major share of the abandoned vehicle activity was performed by non-sworn and cadet personnel, which is not included in this program. The abandoned vehicle activity of Public Safety Officers only is included in the program.
Conduct security checks	12,960	5,416	The decline is due to team policy of greater emphasis on building checks than on vehicle checks.
Initiate traffic actions	22,850	15,298	The decline is due to the low priority subsequently assigned to this activity.
Conduct lectures and tours	1,020	415	———
Issue bicycle licenses	6,000	4,516	———

PATROL SERVICES PROGRAM

COMPLIANCE

Requirements	Results
Prescribed rule of evidence to be followed (Friecke - California Rules of Evidence)	Number of cases lost because of failure to comply with Rules of Evidence Not reportable for Fiscal Year 1975, because the judicial system did not provide the information required to monitor this requirement.
Prescribed conditions for using radar to enforce speed limits (Sec. 40802, California Vehicle Code)	Number of traffic citations issued with the improper use of radar None

ADDITIONAL ACCOMPLISHMENTS

The following Patrol Program accomplishments were in addition to those initially budgeted for the year:

- Two officers have been assigned to Lakewood Village and Ortega Park, respectively, as neighborhood resource officers. This is an experimental program to bring Public Safety Officers into closer contact with the community, and to provide a higher level of service.
- The goal-setting and performance evaluation processes were carried out at the Team/Squad levels by the Team Captains and the Team/Squad members. Thus, the persons whose work enables them to be the most familiar with the City's service needs were making detailed analyses of problems and taking appropriate corrective action.
- Patrol Program members served on tasks forces to:
  - Develop specifications for a new squad car;
  - Prepare operational requirements for the new communication center;
  - Select a bullet proof vest; and
  - Prepare a new Administrative Manual.
- The Graveyard Team instituted a new policy for handling drunken driving, which resulted in more officer time on the street.
- A program was instituted to provide closer liaison between Investigations and Patrol.

CITY OF SUNNYVALE

DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SAFETY

INVESTIGATIONS PROGRAM

Performance Report
Year Ended June 30, 1975

Evaluative Criteria	Intended Program Results: Goals	Intended Program Results: Accomplishments		Department of Public Safety Remarks
Clearance Rate	Maintain departmental clearance rate above nationwide clearance rate for index crimes	Clearance Rates: Nationwide	Clearance Rates: Actual	
	- Homicide	85.45%	100.00%	
	- Rape	56.20	50.00	
	- Robbery	28.80	40.40	
	- Aggravated assault	66.10	70.27	
	- Burglary	18.10	35.77	
	- Larceny over $50	10.80	6.06	Most larcency reports were for insurance purposes only, with little useful information for follow-up.
	- Auto theft	14.50	15.92	
Recidivism Rate	Reduce recidivism among youthful offenders by 10% for the 3 year period 1975 - 1978	% Offenders with Previous Arrest: 7/1/74 - 12/31/74	% Offenders with Previous Arrest: 7/1/74 - 6/30/75	Statistics prior to Fiscal Year 1975 are not available. The recidivism rates are somewhat overstated because juveniles who were arrested more than twice during the year were included in the recidivism statistics for each arrest. The system is being revised to eliminate this feature.
		32.03	34.91	
Input per Case Clearance	Improve management of case investigations	Average Investigative Hours Per Case: Yr '73 - '74	Average Investigative Hours Per Case: Yr '74 - '75	For Fiscal Year 1975, the input per case clearance was derived by dividing the total number of cases cleared by the total number of hours spent in this program. The Department has developed an activity reporting system which will more precisely measure this performance in future years.
		6.73	5.57	

INVESTIGATIONS PROGRAM

	Intended Program Results		Department of Public Safety Remarks
Investigations Conducted	Maintain high level of department integrity and a city free of organized crime	Complaints against officers for graft or corruption - None	
		Complaints against officers for unofficer-like conduct - 20	
		Unfounded[1] - 15	
		Unsubstantiated[2] - 3	
		Substantiated - 2	
		Organized crime operation in the city - None	

[1] lacking a sound basis

[2] not established by proof or competent evidence

PRODUCTION PLAN

	Budgeted	Actual	
Number of follow-up investigations conducted	1,397	1,403	
Number of juvenile contact reports reviewed	1,158	2,713	
Number of interviews and referrals conducted	880	2,484	
Hours spent on monthly liaison meetings between department and community resources	56	Unknown	Actual hours were not available in Fiscal Year 1975.

INVESTIGATIONS PROGRAM

PRODUCTION PLAN	Budgeted	Actual	Department of Public Safety Remarks
Hours spent on support, case control, and supervision	3,628	1,820 (est.)	———
Hours spent on special investigations under the direction of the chief	1,338	Unknown	Actual hours were not available in Fiscal Year 1975.
Hours spent on program supervision	1,822	1,800 (est.)	———

ADDITIONAL ACCOMPLISHMENTS

The following Investigations Program accomplishments were in addition to those initially budgeted for the year:

- Initiated a narcotics unit which has reduced narcotics traffic in Sunnyvale. During the period March-June 1975, undercover narcotics detectives arrested 23 drug dealers for sale of controlled substances, and had five additional narcotics arrests pending.
- A computerized file was established for non-serialized stolen property.

CITY OF SUNNYVALE

DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SAFETY

FIRE PREVENTION PROGRAM

Performance Report
Year Ended June 30, 1975

Intended Program Results			Department of Public Safety Remarks
Evaluative Criteria	Goals	Accomplishments	
Incidence of Fire Hazards	Detect and have fire hazard corrected	Number of Fire Hazards: Detected 8,687; Corrected 6,988	The difference between the number of fire hazards detected and the number corrected results mainly from the 30 day lag between the time a hazard is detected and a subsequent reinspection to determine if the hazard has been corrected.
Knowledge of the Causes of All Fires	Identify the causes of all fires	Number of Fires: Total 814; Cause Determined 662; Cause Not Determined 152	Building fires where losses do not exceed $1,000, and miscellaneous fires, e.g., grass, dumpsters, etc., are not investigated to determine causes, because the cost of obtaining this information would not be commensurate with its value.
Success of Arson Prosecution	Successful prosecution of all persons charged with arson	Number of Arson Arrests 7; Number of Successful Arson Prosecutions 3	During the year, there were 27 arson complaints. All were investigated; 20 were determined to be unfounded/unsubstantiated, and 7 resulted in arrests.

FIRE PREVENTION PROGRAM

Intended Program Results				Department of Public Safety Remarks
Timeliness of Data Input	Record all fire incidents reports and fire inspection reports data within 24 hours	Fire Incidents and Fire Inspection Reports		All inspections and incidents are recorded and inputted into the information system. However, the goal is presently unattainable because insufficient work-hours were allocated for this purpose.
		Total	Number Not Recorded Within 24 Hours	
		14,177	Not Measurable	
Fire Safe Buildings	All new construction meets the Sunnyvale Fire Prevention Code	Number of Plans for New Construction Reviewed for Conformance with the Code		
		525		———

PRODUCTION PLAN

	Budgeted	Actual	
Number of fire prevention and security inspections	13,795	12,011	There were 1,784 instances where prescribed inspections were not made, because of an increase in emergency responses, and increased emphasis on pre-fire planning and training.
Number of fires of unknown origin investigated	270	159	———
Number of plans reviewed	500	525	———
Hours devoted to maintaining fire prevention records and statistics and providing clerical and administrative support	3,027	2,927	———

FIRE PREVENTION PROGRAM

COMPLIANCE

Requirements	Results
Provision in building plan of prescribed facilities, if required (Section 16.52.090, Sunnyvale Municipal Code)	Instances of building plans approved in violation of Code: None
Prescribed fire inspection procedures	Instances when prescribed inspections not made: 1,784
Investigation and timely preparation of fire incident report	Instances in which fire reports were not submitted within two days: Unknown

CITY OF SUNNYVALE

DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SAFETY

FIRE SUPPRESSION PROGRAM

Performance Report
Year Ended June 30, 1975

Intended Program Results

Evaluative Criteria	Goals	Accomplishments			
		Response Time (min.)	No. of Emergency Responses	% of Emergency Responses	Cumulative Percentage
Response Time	Be at scene of fire or emergency within 3 minutes 95% of the time	0	9	1.8	1.8
		1	24	4.9	6.7
		2	77	15.7	22.4
		3	139	28.4	50.8
		4	143	29.2	80.0
		5	61	12.4	92.4
		6	21	4.3	96.7
		7 and over	16	3.3	100.0
			490	100.0	

Average response time = 3.67
Standard deviation = 2.60

Department of Public Safety Remarks

There were no major problems with controllable variables, such as apparatus failure, responding in the wrong direction, communication errors, and delays in leaving quarters. Response time was impacted by the following uncontrollable factors:

1. Fire stations not located in the exact center of the corresponding response areas; therefore, more travel time is required to reach outlying areas.

2. Weather (rain and fog) and traffic and road conditions.

3. The performance of inspection activities which takes fire fighters out of quarters and then necessitates that they travel to their apparatus by foot, sometimes for a minute or more.

4. An increasing number of simultaneous calls for service within the same area.

As a result, the 3 minutes/95% goal is considered unrealistic and has been revised to 4 minutes, 90% of the time.

FIRE SUPPRESSION PROGRAM

Intended Program Results

Response Capability

Reduce death, injuries and property loss resulting from fire by 10%, ensure suppression activities maintain losses at a minimum level

	Yr '73-'74	Yr '74-'75	% Change
Fire-related deaths	0	2	+200.00
Fire-related injuries	53	24	- 54.72
Fire-related property loss	$921,938	$1,299,881	+ 40.99

Malfunctions

Assure 100% response and fire suppression capabilities

Number of Equipment Malfunctions Yr '74-'75

None

Rekindles

Zero rekindles

Number of Rekindles

3

Citizen Contacts

Reduce injuries and losses from fire by having an informed public, contacting one third of the population each year

Total Population	Population Contacted No.	Population Contacted % of Total
106,400	11,934	11.2

Department of Public Safety Remarks

_____

_____

$435,000 of the $1.3 million in property loss was caused by two out of a total of 294 building fires.

_____

All rekindles were minor, i.e., the damage which might have resulted from a potential rekindle was judged not to justify the cost of leaving apparatus at the scene to prevent a rekindle.

The home inspection program has never been completely effective, because there is no requirement for citizens to eliminate fire hazards detected during the inspections. During the fuel crisis of 1973-74, the program was accorded a lower priority than previously and the number of Department-initiated citizen contacts generally declined. Citizen-initiated requests for fire-related demonstrations and presentations also declined, thereby contributing to the reduced number of contacts. The program was also found not to be cost-effective, and without the home inspection program, such a sizeable audience will not be reached.

FIRE SUPPRESSION PROGRAM

PRODUCTION PLAN

	Budgeted	Actual	Department of Public Safety Remarks
Hours required for ready stand-by in quarters and for inspection and maintenance of apparatus	112,420	106,685 (est.)	———
Fires, rescues, and emergencies responded to	2,200	2,666	Greater than budgeted responses result mainly from the new policy of automatically responding to personal injury traffic accidents and increased requests for recusitator.
Inspection of fire protection systems or devices	6,000	9,759	———
Pre-fire planning conducted on target harards	130	159	———
Man-hours used on fire safety lectures and fire station tours	1,327	1,319	———

ADDITIONAL ACCOMPLISHMENTS

The following Fire Suppression Program accomplishments were in addition to those initially budgeted for the year:

- A computerized hose, air tank, and equipment inventory was developed.
- An annual testing program for ground/aerial ladders and snorkels was started.
- A new Fire Prevention Code was developed.
- A Fire Division Manual was prepared.
- Training manuals and visual aids for in-service training were updated.
- A new advanced training and testing system was developed.
- New hose loads were developed.
- A computerized P.S.O. activity reporting system for the Fire Suppression and Fire Prevention programs was developed.
- Participation in the blood pressure screening program.
- Participation in the Insurance Service Office field grading survey.

CITY OF SUNNYVALE

DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SAFETY

PUBLIC SAFETY MANAGEMENT PROGRAM

Performance Report
Year Ended June 30, 1975

Evaluative Criteria	Intended Program Results: Goals	Intended Program Results: Accomplishments	Department of Public Safety Remarks
Level of Leadership	100% accomplishment of all program goals by year-end	Number of Programs Goals Not Accomplished in Fiscal Year 1975	This goal has been deemed unrealistic and not reflective of that which best depicts management accomplishment. Accordingly, a new evaluative criteria will be established to better relfect the leadership expected of Departmental management.
	Achieve and maintain a 0% incidence of complaints warranting disciplinary action	Number of Complaints Warranting Disciplinary Action: None	Complaints warranting disciplinary action relate to citizen complaints regarding service provided, and not to complaints involving Department integrity.
Level of Performance	Keep Sunnyvale among top 25% in nation for lowest crime rate	Number of Crimes	

	Top 25%	Sunnyvale
Homicide	6	3
Rape	22	24
Robbery	199	99
Aggravated assault	155	74
Burglary	1,606	1,272
Larceny over $50	1,102	941
Auto theft	470	402

Level of Performance	Review fire insurance rating annually	Most Recent Review of Fire Insurance Rating: May 1975	

PUBLIC SAFETY MANAGEMENT PROGRAM

Intended Program Results				Department of Public Safety Remarks
Resource Utilization	Maintain optimum utilization of patrol services	Percent of Time a Vehicle is in Use	Number of Vehicles	
		0 - 20	2	
		20 - 40	3	
		40 - 60	6	
		60 - 80	11	
		80 - 100	1	
			23	
	Maximum utilization achieved for a vehicle		95%	
	Minimum utilization achieved for a vehicle		7%	
	Average utilization for all vehicles		53%	
	Median utilization for all vehicles		61%	

PRODUCTION PLAN

	Budgeted	Actual	
Hours devoted to Departmental leadership	1,870	1,870 (est.)	
Hours devoted to monitoring programs	3,580	3,580 (est.)	
Vehicles usage audit	104	168 (est.)	

COMPLIANCE

Requirements	Results
Minimum employment standards	Instances of standards not met
	None
Minimum lateral entry standards	Instances of standard not met
	No lateral entries this year
Required probationary periods	Instances of insufficient probation
	None
Required personal history investigation	Instances of no or inadequate investigation
	None
Required physical examinations	Instances of no physical examination
	None

CITY OF SUNNYVALE

DEPARTMENT OF PUBIC SAFETY

TRAINING PROGRAM

Performance Report
Year Ended June 30, 1975

Intended Program Results				Department of Public Safety Remarks
Evaluative Criteria	Goals	Accomplishments		
Types and Amounts of Training	Meet State and Department initial and advanced training requirements for all Public Safety personnel	No. of Officers Required to Take Courses	No. of Officers Completed Required Courses	
	- Basic Course	14	14	_____
	- Supervisory Course	2	2	_____
	- Middle Management Course	0	0	_____
	- Advanced Officers Course	3	67	Sixty-four officers took the Advanced Officers Course on their own time. Four years had not elapsed since their last required training.
Timeliness and Quality of Training Material	Review and upgrade 20% of training material			The goal established for this category was not tied to a standard which allowed an assessment for accomplishments. Generally, the training materials were kept current and new materials were added throughout the year.

Type	No.	No. Upgraded	New
Lesson Plans	75	2	10
Information Sheet	48	5	4
Books in Library	517	-	26
Codes	5	5	-
Periodicals	9	9	-
Video Films	41	-	11
Sound on Slides	5	-	-
Slides W/Taped Audio	6	-	1
Films, 16mm	18	-	1

TRAINING PROGRAM

PRODUCTION PLAN

		Budgeted	Actual	Department of Public Safety Remarks
Basic police and fire academy training for all recruits	Recruits	16	14	Only fourteen recruits were hired during the year.
	Hrs. of Training	9,960	9,723	———
55 hours of in-service training and 15 hours of fire training for each patrol division line officer	Police Training	4,125	6,627	———
	Fire Training	1,125	1,354	———
222 hours of in-service fire training and 20 hours police training for each fire division station-based officer	Fire Training	14,652	20,627	The fire training budget was surpassed because of preparation for the Insurance Services Office Survey, pre-fire survey, and the lieutenants' training program. Police training for the fire station assigned personnel did not meet the plan because of the absence of a planned training program.
	Police Training	1,320	681	
Training and work experience program for all public safety cadets	Cadets	9	9.5	———
	Training Hours	6,000	7,121	———
Video films and slide series produced and updated	Video Films	10	11	———
	Slide Series	4	1	———

TRAINING PROGRAM

COMPLIANCE

Requirements	Results	
Prescribed Minimum Training Requirements (California Penal Code, Title IV, Chapter I, Article 2, Section 13510) for:		Instances of Insufficient Training
	Trainees	None
	Supervisors	None
	Middle Managers	None
	Advanced Officers	None

ADDITIONAL ACCOMPLISHMENTS

The following training program accomplishments were in addition to those initially budgeted for the year:

- All lieutenants were sent to a 40-hour management training course.
- An automated activity reporting system was developed to record the amount and type of training provided each officer.
- A minority recruiting program was instituted to make minority groups aware of opportunities in the Department.

CITY OF SUNNYVALE

DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SAFETY

COMMUNICATIONS PROGRAM

Performance Report
Year Ended June 30, 1975

Intended Program Results

Evaluative Criteria	Goals	Accomplishments
Timeliness of Communications	Receive and relay emergency information within one minute 95% of the time	Number of Emergency Dispatches: 5,398; Number Dispatched in 1 Minute: 5,285; Percent Dispatched in 1 Minute: 97.91
Timeliness of EDP Entries	Input all data in EDP systems within 15 minutes of receipt of information	Not Determinable
Timeliness of Service Calls	Respond to calls for service consistent with Department policy 100% of the time	Calls for Service: Number Received: 54,504; Number Handled in Conformity with Department Policy: 54,504; % Handled in Conformity with Department Policy: 100.00
Equipment Delays and Malfunctions	0% downtime with communication services	Number of Failures: Radio System 0; Phone System 0; Outside Computer Systems 41; In-House Computer Systems 201

Department of Public Safety Remarks

The primary goal of the Communications section is to receive and dispatch all priority three emergency calls in less than 60 seconds. While the speed with which the data is inputted by the dispatchers has no effect on the prime function of communications, i.e., receiving and relaying emergency calls for service, this goal has been established to provide an incentive to enter information as quickly as possible, thereby maximizing the quality of the information.

Neither the outside nor the in-house computer systems affect the receipt and relaying of emergency calls, so none of the equipment failures impaired communications services.

PRODUCTION PLAN	Budgeted	Actual	Department of Public Safety Remarks
Number of calls for emergency safety service received and dispatched	2,600	5,398	The definition of emergency calls was changed after the budget had been prepared. A priority three emergency call is any call which may constitute an immediate or potential hazard to life or property. This includes in-progress calls or any call for which the time element of the arrival of the responding unit may have a bearing on the incident.
Number of calls for non-emergency service received and dispatched	40,876 40,876	49,106 49,106	———
Number of EDP entries, updates, and inquiries	900,000	490,874	———
Hours spent on upgrading communication facilities by implementing a UHF radio system	300	Not Determinable	A UHF portable radio system is in operation for tactical usage. The City is also upgrading its communciations system through funding from the Law Enforcement Assistance Administration.
Record and display operational status of personnel and equipment	2,450	Not Determinable	———

CITY OF SUNNYVALE

DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SAFETY

STAFF SERVICES PROGRAM

Performance Report
Year Ended June 30, 1975

Evaluative Criteria	Intended Program Results: Goals	Intended Program Results: Accomplishments		Department of Public Safety Remarks
Delivery of Reports	Provide crime and fire statistical reports within 24 hours as requested	Statistical Reports Requested: 232	Requested Reports Not Delivered in 24 Hours: 5	Response outside the standard is primarily due to computer down-time and intervening service priorities.
Warrant Turnaround	Dispose of warrants within 30 days of receipt within Department of Public Safety	Number of Warrants Disposed of In More than 30 Days: 105		The Staff Services Program is responsible only for the filing and storage of warrants. The function is being reviewed to determine if the evaluative criteria and goal are appropriate for the Patrol Services Program, rather than for the Staff Services Program.
Security and Integrity of Files, Evidence, and Property	Maintain 0% incidence of unauthorized access to files, or lost or misclassified property	Number of Recorded Incidence of: Unauthorized Access to Files: Not determinable	Lost/Misplaced Property: 3	The misplaced property was neither of a sensitive nature nor material in value. Two of the items were later found.
Proportion of Successfully Prosecuted Cases	Increase the proportion of successfully prosecuted cases 5% by analyzing the determinants of convictions and acquittals and by acting accordingly	Not presently determinable		Information on case disposition is received from the judicial system only by calendar year. Since the City figures are on a fiscal year basis, it is impossible to complete an analysis.

STAFF SERVICES PROGRAM

PRODUCTION PLAN

	Budgeted	Actual	Department of Public Safety Remarks
Reports processed	14,785	12,723	———
Number of cases requiring storage and/or management of evidence	2,605	2,206	———
Number of warrants for service processed	8,000	2,629	The number of warrants received is an extraneous factor over which the Department has no control. The number of warrants to be served was projected at too high a level.
Criminal court case appearances	6,355	1,506	The number of court appearances was also projected at too high a level.

COMPLIANCE

Requirements	Results
Prescribed requirements for the installation and maintenance of records, reports of statistical data, and access to statistical data. Prescribed procedures and requirements for acquiring, valuing, advertising, and disposing of found property. Prescribed procedures for the proper control, maintenance, and disposition of evidence in criminal cases and stolen or embezzeled property.	Instances of late or incorrect data filings with State agency None Instances of violation None Instances in which the prescribed procedures not followed None

ADDITIONAL ACCOMPLISHMENTS

The following Staff Services Program accomplishments were in addition to those initially budgeted for the year:

- Installation and implementation of a microfilm system for the storing of incident reports, dispatch cards, and other hard copy files.
- Implementation of a computerized Modus Operandi (M.O.) File to assist detectives in case investigations.
- Initial design of a system for providing real time information for personnel fighting chemical fires.
- Institution of a crime analysis program to analyze burglary and robbery patterns on a recurring basis.
- Special Studies:
  - Analysis of burglaries for the City Council;
  - Analysis of thefts in parks;
  - Analysis of optimum hiring and replacement policies; and
  - Analysis of the location of emergency medical units in order to provide a 3-minute response time.

CITY OF SUNNYVALE

DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC SAFETY

Performance Report
Year Ended June 30, 1975

ACCOUNTANT'S COMMENTS

During the performance audit, certain observations were made of the ways in which the Department accomplished the intended results for each program, the manner in which it utilized available resources, and its compliance with pertinent laws and regulations. These observations and related recommendations are presented for consideration by the City. Observations and recommendations pertaining to the Department as a whole are presented first, followed by recommendations related to each of the eight Public Safety Programs. Some of the recommendations pertain to refining criteria and goals, some to the reliability of data, and some to improving the operations.

This is the first year that the Department of Public Safety's program managers have been required to submit quarterly reports of performance toward established goals and production plans. Evaluating performance in relation to goals is an iterative process which requires not only the continuous monitoring of performance, but also the updating of goals as deemed appropriate. This year's evaluations have disclosed that some of the goals did not reflect realistic values, and that others need to be refined. In addition, performance is affected by both controllable and non-controllable factors. The reader should, therefore, keep these points in mind when reading the following comments.

OVERALL MANAGEMENT CONCERNS

CRITERIA AND GOALS

The City's planning, budgeting, and management processes are linked together by the budget and its supporting documents, the 28-day reports, and the program managers' quarterly reviews. The information presented in these documents is not uniform in all cases. For

example, some of the goals contained in the quarterly reviews are not included in the budget. Conversely, not all the elements in the budget are included in the quarterly reviews. Some goals are used by the Department for internal purposes only, and others are used on a trial basis to determine whether they should be adopted the following year.

The management process could be significantly improved by integrating these various elements and ensuring that there is a consistency in the data used for planning, budgeting, monitoring, reporting, and analysis.

Furthermore, the process for establishing goals, evaluating performance, and revising goals needs further strengthening. Since the program managers are to be held accountable for achieving the goals, they should have the prime responsibility for the establishing, evaluating, and revising tasks. Departmental management should monitor the process and assure that all major activities of each program are covered. The process should be undertaken and completed before budget preparation begins. In this way, sufficient time can be devoted to the development of relevant and valid criteria and goals, and all goals can be incorporated in the budget. Also, a value can be established for each goal during the budget preparation process that is realistic in terms of the resources that are available and can be allocated to the program.

Other suggestions relating to criteria and goals are:

- Existing criteria, goals, and production plans, once established, should not be changed or deleted until after the end of the year to which they apply. These would be the criteria included in the performance audit.

- New goals and production plans may be added, as considered necessary, during the year.

- Program managers must be provided with pertinent statistical information on new goals and production plans.

RELIABILITY OF DATA

Reconciliation of Data to Financial System

The information accumulated for measuring performance against goals and production plans should be reconciled with comparable information collected in the financial system. Examples of areas where this can be done are bicycle license sales, hours reported for training and court appearances, and the officer activity reporting system.

Reconciliation of the Monthly Reports to the 28-Day Reports

The Department of Public Safety operates on a 28-day reporting cycle. Agencies to which the Department reports statistical data (e.g., California Bureau of Criminal Statistics) request data on a monthly basis. The year-to-date totals on the monthly reports to outside agencies are adjusted to account for changes in the status of previously reported incidents, but the 28-day reports are not. As a result, there are inconsistencies between the 28-day reports and the monthly reports. This inconsistency cannot be easily resolved between the two reports for a particular month, but the year-to-date totals on each report should be reconciled, so that at year end each report shows the same total number of incidents by type.

OPERATIONAL IMPROVEMENTS

Through the Public Safety Information System, the Department is collecting considerable data pertinent to public safety resources and activities. Currently, the data is being used mainly for planning and for day-to-day management. In view of the comprehensiveness of this data base, the Department should consider preparing a plan for gradually undertaking the kinds of data analyses that furnish insight into the various economy, efficiency, and effectiveness factors pertaining to public safety operations. Examples of the types of analyses that might be undertaken are:

- the relationship between clearance rates, investigative hours, and types of crimes;

- the relationship between traffic accident rates, number of traffic citations issued, number of traffic enforcement hours applied, preventive patrol hours applied, and climatic conditions; and

- the relationship between the incidence of fires, types of of fire prevention activities conducted, the number of fire training hours, and the number of hours devoted to fire prevention.

The plan should provide for one or two initial analyses and then identify additional potential analyses in priority sequence. Also, it should specify the hypotheses to be tested and the techniques to be used in the analysis process.

The fire prevention computer system generates report guides for inspections conducted by fire station personnel. The completed report guides are used to update the computer system and, if required, for the issuance of appropriate violation notices. However, the Department does not have the summary printouts, listings, or special tabulations using the updated fire prevention file. Consequently, the Department cannot analyze completed inspections, nor can it adequately control the inspections. Fire station officers and support personnel must hand-tally inspection information to prepare summary reports. The Department should take appropriate action to obtain the indicated printouts and listings from the information system.

The California Fire Incident Reporting System (CFIRS) has been adopted for use in Sunnyvale. The Department of Public Safety forwards a computer tape containing the required fire information to CFIRS and receives in return an annual printout of fire information. The fire incident reports which are the basic inputs to this system are input in an on-line mode to the Sunnyvale information system. Currently, the Sunnyvale fire reporting system allows input, update, and on-line retrieval of individual fire incidents records. However, the Department does not have computer-generated ongoing management reports. Those management reports which are prepared are hand-tallied from the fire incident reports by the Sunnyvale clerical staff who input the fire incident reports to the computer system. As a result, there is insufficient information available for use in fire planning, and an excessive amount of clerical work is being done. As recommended for the fire prevention system, the Department should take the appropriate action to ensure that the required tabulations of the fire incident reports are obtained.

Program Managers' Quarterly Reviews

Program managers presently use their own individual formats for the quarterly reviews. Management analysis would be expedited if there were a standard format for the quarterly reports.

PATROL SERVICES PROGRAM

CRITERIA AND GOALS

Traffic Accident Rate

We understand that for Fiscal Year 1976, the Department is expanding the goals related to traffic accidents in order to monitor fatal and personal injury accidents. We believe that an even more meaningful evaluation could be made if the goals were further refined to consider the number of traffic accidents resulting in property damage over a certain dollar amount, and the causes of traffic accidents, i.e., speeding, drunken driving, and reckless driving. This type of breakdown would enable the Department to formulate appropriate enforcement policies.

Crime Rate

While the Performance Report for the year ended June 30, 1975, shows index crime data as a percent of change over the prior fiscal year, a more meaningful assessment of Sunnyvale's performance would include comparisons with the per capita crime rates for similar size cities in the nation, San Francisco and San Jose Standard Metropolitan Statistical Areas, and surrounding jurisdictions, as well as against past performance.

OPERATIONAL IMPROVEMENTS

Dispatch Activity Records

During the past fiscal year, the Department began to microfilm the dispatch cards and to maintain a summary computer tape of dispatch activity. We believe that this improvement will enhance management of the Patrol Program by permitting review and analysis of historical data.

Response Time

The Patrol Captains do not receive response time summaries with their 28-day reports. This information should be provided them to assist in their managing performance against the response time goal,

and assessing its reasonableness. In addition, the Patrol Captains should be required to review and report upon any emergency calls for which there was an excessive response time.

Use of the Information System

The patrol teams are using much of the information contained in the Public Safety Information System(PSIS). During the current year, the lieutenants and captains will attend a 40-hour course in quantitative decision making. This should further increase the use of the PSIS. The Planning and Research Office should therefore have a plan by which it regularly assesses and identifies the information needs of the Patrol Services Program, and attempts to adapt the information in PSIS to meet the emerging needs. Examples of such modifications might be calculation of the average response time and the distribution among the different response times, or the more frequent production of burglary reports. If the Planning and Research Office does not have sufficient resources to assure that the PSIS is always fulfilling identified needs and additional resources cannot be obtained, the needs to be met should be identified in priority order and a plan developed for meeting at least the high priority needs.

Prescribed Rules of Evidence

It is difficult to determine the number of cases lost due to failure to comply with prescribed rules of evidence because the courts (i) do not provide information on a timely basis, and (ii) do not identify the reasons for dismissal. Without this information, the Department can neither be assured of compliance nor improve performance. The Department has been studying this condition and is attempting to obtain case disposition information on a timely basis. We suggest that this effort be continued so that the Department may identify cases lost due to the Department's failure to comply, and take appropriate action.

INVESTIGATIONS PROGRAM

CRITERIA AND GOALS

Clearance Rate

The City presently evaluates the effectiveness of clearance activities by comparing its performance against the FBI Index. This comparison can give some indication of accomplishment. However, because of the many inconsistencies in the statistics used to develop the FBI Index, we suggest that performance also be evaluated by comparing the City's current year's clearance rates with its prior year's clearance rates.

Recidivism

The "Diversion Rate" evaluative criteria has been changed to "Recidivism Rate," to coincide with the stated goal. The goal as now stated, i.e., to reduce recidivism by 10% over a three year period, was derived from a Federal grant obtained by Sunnyvale and several other jurisdictions. We believe it would be better to state the goal in terms of annual reductions in the recidivism rate. Furthermore, we suggest that in order to avoid problems of "double counting," and the adverse impact this would have on performance measurement, the Department should measure accomplishments in terms of reducing the number of individual recidivists. The Department should, however, analyze the number of times the individual recidivists are arrested, as an aid in planning the total juvenile program.

Consideration also should be given to adding a goal which relates to juveniles diverted from the criminal justice system. Although diversion is very difficult to measure, properly accumulated data would reveal how well the City is performing in the worthwhile endeavor to divert juveniles from the criminal justice system.

Input Per Case Clearance

The input per case clearance goal should be refined to show the average investigative time spent on each type of index crime. Performance could then be related to the clearance rate criteria. The new Investigations activity reporting system should be able to produce the needed information for expanding the measurement.

RELIABILITY OF DATA

Clearance Rate

The system for clearing cases provides that the assigned detective prepare the clearance record, and that the record then be reviewed by the lieutenant in charge of investigations. We suggest that cases involving large numbers of clearances attributable to one arrest also be reviewed by a higher management level, e.g., the Police Commander or the Chief, to assure that all requirements for clearing cases have been met.

FIRE PREVENTION PROGRAM

CRITERIA AND GOALS

Fire Hazards Detected and Corrected

The determination of the incidences of fire hazards detected and corrected could be made into a meaningful tool if it were expanded to show the different types of hazards, i.e., exits; housekeeping; storage; electrical; heating; extinguishing equipment; flammable liquids; compressed gasses; and chemicals, explosives, and miscellaneous gasses, and the number of reinspections made during the year. Once this is done, the Department can relate the degree of accomplishment desired to the severity of the hazard, such that 100% of the most severe hazards should be corrected, while a lesser percentage of corrections would be acceptable for the relatively minor hazards that do not warrant a high priority.

Determining Causes of All Fires

The preliminary identification of the causes of all fires is made on the fire incident report by the officers who respond to the fire. The fire prevention program manager investigates major fires to determine their cause, and to change the fire incident report if appropriate. No attempt is made, however, to identify the causes of minor fires. Consequently, the goal should be stated and data classified in terms of "major fires" and "minor fires."

Fire Inspection Production Targets

The fire inspection production targets should be reviewed in light of the number of prescribed inspections that were not made during the year, and the fact that due to the demands in the fire suppression program which includes pre-fire planning, training, and equipment maintenance, the manpower to conduct inspections cannot be increased without increasing current staffing. This recommendation is particularly meaningful in light of the fact that the number of required annual fire inspections increased by 360 during the six months ending July 30, 1975, and will undoubtedly increase still further as increases in construction activity generate more inspection requirements.

RELIABILITY OF DATA

Clerical Support Budget

The Fire Prevention Program's budget includes the clerical support required by both the Fire Suppression Program and the Training Program. This precludes an accurate accounting of the clerical support by program. We suggest, therefore, that in the future, clerical support be identified and budgeted by program. A more realistic assessment of support needs for each program can then be made, and better control maintained over the manner in which these resources are applied.

Supervisory Time Reporting

At present, no allocation is made within the Fire Prevention Program for supervisory time. Accordingly, supervisory time is now buried in other functions and the supervisory function probably has not received the full measure of attention. A supervision category should, therefore, be established to provide proper recognition of the supervisory function, and an accurate record of the time available for and spent on fire inspections, determining the causes of fires, and reviewing building plans.

OPERATIONAL IMPROVEMENTS

Fire Inspections

Inspection requirements by fire stations vary from month to month, making the assigned production targets easy to attain in one month, but virtually impossible to attain the following month. This unequal distribution is caused by new building inspections being added to the system and reinspections for older buildings occurring in the same month. This inequity could well affect the quality of inspections, as officers attempt to meet their production targets, and/or discouragement on the part of officers when they are given impossible production targets. For example, during the past year the average elapsed time per inspection, including familiarization with the facility and preparation of the inspection report, was less than 30 minutes. Two solutions the Department could consider are (1) whether the inspection frequency of some buildings can be lessened, and (2) whether a mathematical model can be developed to allocate inspections more evenly between months, priority of inspections, and the six fire stations.

FIRE SUPPRESSION PROGRAM

CRITERIA AND GOALS

Response Capability

The response capability criteria should be refined to measure the effects of fire more precisely. For example, it seems appropriate to offset the impact of inflation on the dollar amount of property loss. This could be done by using index numbers to adjust the amount of the property loss to the same base as the assessed valuation, or by expressing the property loss as a percent of assessed property value. In addition, there should be a way to discount the impact of major fires on the total amount of annual property loss. Perhaps this can be accomplished by segregating major structure fires from minor structure fires.

Rekindles

The zero rekindles criteria should be refined to encompass only those rekindles which could potentially cause significant property loss. Minor rekindles should be excluded because they are not a good measure of performance. It often is not cost effective to leave officers and apparatus at the scene where, even if a rekindle did occur, the potential loss would be very minimal.

OPERATIONAL IMPROVEMENTS

Planning and Support Workload

It appears as though the Fire Suppression Program does not have sufficient support and planning resources. The support staff is shared with the Fire Prevention and the Training Programs. Some of the support workload might be reduced when the information systems for the fire programs become operational and the hand tallying of fire report data is automated. On the other hand, once the fire incident system is operational and can be combined with the fire prevention files, a large amount of previously unavailable data will be available for analysis and planning purposes. The Fire Suppression Program managers do not have sufficient uninterrupted blocks of time to devote to such analyses. Consequently, the Department should analyze both the types and amounts of planning and support workload, and determine the resources necessary to accomplish the work.

PUBLIC SAFETY MANAGEMENT PROGRAM

CRITERIA AND GOALS

Level of Leadership

The thrust of this program is to provide leadership to the other Department of Public Safety program managers. Level of leadership is an extremely difficult activity to measure; evidently, accomplishment of 100 percent of the Department's goals is not a suitable criteria. It is reliant upon the efforts of the other program managers, and does not reflect the many types of leadership activities that should be performed. We therefore recommend that the leadership criteria be revised to embody the types of leadership activities that the Departmental leadership performs. For example:

- Maintaining a formal system for evaluating goals and production plans and assuring that they are suitable for and representative of the various programs' activities.

- Assuring that program managers' quarterly performance evaluations are meaningful and timely.

- Assuring that appropriate actions are taken in those cases where the performance evaluations disclose a need for action.

Complaints

To avoid possible confusion, the goal related to complaints should be restated to clearly indicate that it pertains to citizen complaints, not complaints involving Departmental integrity. Furthermore, a log of citizen complaints should be maintained showing details and disposition of complaints.

Vehicle Utilization Data

The data on vehicle utilization presented in the performance report does not present complete and meaningful information on patrol vehicle use. The statistics are presented on the basis of individual vehicle usage. It would seem better to also determine the maximum number of vehicles in use during a specified period of time, in relation to the number available for use, such as by shift.

TRAINING PROGRAM

CRITERIA AND GOALS

Training Materials

While the timeliness and quality of training materials is a worthwhile evaluative criteria, there is no requirement for a training plan which specifies the types of materials and aids needed to accomplish the plan. Currently, fire has an extensive training plan but a similar plan is needed for police and should be developed.

OPERATIONAL IMPROVEMENTS

Police Officer Training Needs

The monitoring of the individual training needs of fire officers is accomplished with the manually maintained fire activity reporting system. This information will soon be automated. An extension of the automated system to record the training needs of police officers would aggregate information as to training needs for these personnel and would thus help to project total future training needs. We note that plans have been made to extend the system to police, and we concur.

COMMUNICATIONS PROGRAM

RELIABILITY OF DATA

Complaints Regarding Calls for Service

All radio and phone traffic is tape recorded and complaints regarding the handling/processing of calls are checked against the tape. However, there is no record kept of the complaint, the persons involved, or the disposition of the matter. We suggest that a log containing this information be maintained by the program manager, in order to permit evaluation of this activity and to answer subsequent questions pertaining to the complaints.

EDP Entries/Inquiries

The Communications Program reports the actual EDP entries/inquiries for each reporting period as an extrapolation of one day's observations. This approach does not provide an accurate measure of activity. If EDP entries/inquiries are to be measured, we suggest that the computer be used to accumulate and report the number of entries/inquiries.

Further, computer printouts are reviewed manually to discover errors. Much of this routine checking can be eliminated by building input verification routines into the computer software. The installation of the new communications system will provide an excellent opportunity to make these system improvements.

OPERATIONAL IMPROVEMENTS

Data Input

Ideally, the dispatchers should input data into the system during the 4 a.m. - 8 a.m. time period, when dispatch activity is at its lowest. However, this cannot be done because the computer is down for maintenance during this time period. When the new mini-computer is obtained, it should be made available during the 4 a.m. - 8 a.m. time period for input and storage of information which would subsequently be transferred to the main computer.

Security

Appropriate security should be provided when the new equipment is installed. For example, there should be a visitors' viewing area but the dispatchers and equipment should be isolated from this area. This would maximize security, improve the morale of dispatchers, avoid disruption of the dispatch activity, and at the same time provide good public relations.

Dispatcher Training

Twenty-four hours of training is to be provided dispatchers in Fiscal Year 1976 to familiarize them with the new communications system. The Department should determine what additional training is needed and/or desirable for dispatchers in order to ensure uniformity of operations and upgrade the quality of dispatch service.

STAFF SERVICES PROGRAM

CRITERIA AND GOALS

Comprehensiveness of Criteria

The existing criteria, goals, and production plan do not accurately portray the full range of activities and workload of the Staff Services Program. An additional analysis should be made to determine suitable criteria, goals, and appropriate production plan data. In so doing, consideration should be given to the major types of activities performed, such as typing support for other programs, requests for information from PSOs and other agencies, and number of insurance requests processed. The feasibility of adapting the Patrol Services Program activities reporting system to Staff Services, using general work categories, should be considered.

Warrant Turnaround Time

The warrant turnaround time criteria should be reviewed to determine whether or not it is valid. Non-criminal warrants comprise the major portion and serving these warrants is given a low priority. If the criteria is kept, it should be assigned to the Patrol Services Program, which is responsible for serving the warrants. This would not negate the need for Staff Services to maintain the formal warrant log on a current basis by indicating the warrant number, date issued, and final disposition, if any. On those warrants where there is no disposition, they should be periodically reconciled to the hard-copy warrant file.

Delivery of Reports

The criteria pertaining to delivery of reports is particularly valid because it measures not only the performance of Sunnyvale clerical personnel, but also the reliability of the PSIS hardware. As indicated in the Performance Report, however, due to computer downtime and intervening service priorities, the goal of 24-hour response time is not always achieved. It would seem appropriate, therefore, to indicate a percent of time that the goal is expected to be met, such as 90 or 95 percent of the time. In addition, it should be clearly stated that this criteria and goal refer only to the computer input/output process.

RELIABILITY OF DATA

Requests for Data

We suggest that a logging procedure be established for requests for information and reports. The log should identify reports requested, by type. This approach would provide an accurate record of turnaround times, reflect any problems in delivering specific types of files, e.g., arrest, offense, and indicate whether any reports should be ordered on a routine or regular basis, rather than being specially requested.

OPERATIONAL IMPROVEMENTS

Annual Plan

The Planning and Research Office should have an annual plan specifying the activities it will perform during the year. Many programs in the Department of Public Safety have identified areas in which formal planning assistance is needed. Also, there are many unanticipated requests for planning staff to assist other City agencies (e.g., management exchange program and the citizen survey). While not all planning activities can be scheduled, many can be defined in terms of when they will take place, how long they will take, and who will perform them. The process of defining what must be done each year will allow tradeoffs to be made with available planning resources. Also, the first consideration can be given to those activities which will provide the greatest benefit to the Department.

Computer File Security

A specific individual should be assigned the responsibility for controlling access to the computer files and to be aware of changes in California law regarding security of public safety files. In addition, any California law covering security of public safety information files should be made a compliance requirement of this program.

Staff Manual

Consideration should be given to preparing a manual describing the various functions of the clerical staff to be used as a training device for new personnel. The manual would also facilitate the implementation of a clerical activity reporting system.

77 00853

U.C. BERKELEY LIBRARIES
C123318062

INSTITUTE OF GOVERNMENTAL STUDIES LIBRARY
109 PHILOSOPHY HALL
UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA
BERKELEY, CA 94720